

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Patrick Littleford and Michael Norton Jr., Building Services Coordinator 1 (PS3958K), Department of Children and Families

CSC Docket Nos. 2019-523

2019-498

Examination Appeals

ISSUED: October 22, 2018 (RE)

Patrick Littleford and Michael Norton Jr. appeal the determinations of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that they did not meet the minimum requirements in experience for the promotional examination for Building Services Coordinator 1 (PS3958K), Department of Children and Families.

:

:

The subject examination had a closing date of December 21, 2017 and was open to employees in the non-competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in the title Repairer and who met the open competitive requirements OR to employees in the competitive division who had an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and who met the open competitive requirements. These requirements included two years of experience in property maintenance, including scheduling, coordinating and expediting alteration, renovation and repair work, and vendor management. Eight candidates appeared on the eligible list, which was certified twice, and one appointment has been made.

Littleford listed four positions on his application: Repairer, Electrician, Carpenter, Electrician and Telecommunications Specialist. As none of his experience was accepted, he was found to be lacking two years of applicable experience. On appeal, Littleford submitted a resume with one additional position, Senior Repairer, from November 2017 to the December 2017 closing date.

Norton listed four positions on his application: provisional Building Services Coordinator 1, Senior Repairer, Repairer, and Driver/Fire Fighter. He was credited with one year, eight months of experience as a provisional in the subject title, and he was found to be lacking four months of applicable experience. On appeal, Norton states that he is a provisional in the subject title and provides a long list of duties for that position. Additionally, the appellant provides a narrative description of his duties as a Repairer and Senior Repairer. He indicates that as a Senior Repairer he was "responsible for the day to day activities while include scheduling, coordinating and working with vendors on the repair and maintenance of building issues..." He also states that he dealt with the Office of Telecommunications and Verizon regarding phone issues and installations. He submits a letter from his supervisor who attests to the duties in the appeal, and from the appointing authority who concurs.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the promotional examination announcement by the closing date. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.1(f) provides that an application may be amended prior to the announced closing date.

Applicants must demonstrate on their applications that the duties they perform provide them with the experience required for eligibility. See In the Matter of Charles Klingberg (MSB, decided August 28, 2001). In order for experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). Next, when an applicant indicates extensive experience in titles established under the State Classification Plan, it is appropriate to utilize the job specifications to determine the primary focus of the duties of incumbents serving in career service titles. In the eligibility screening process, reliance on the job specifications to determine the primary focus of duties for incumbents of a particular title or title series provides a standardized basis on which DAS can compare what an applicant indicates on his or her application to what incumbents in a particular title series generally perform. See In the Matter of William Moore (MSB, decided May 10, 2006).

A Building Services Coordinator 1 schedules, coordinates and expedites the alterations, renovations, repairs, and maintenance of office space. As such, the experience requirement is not simply property maintenance or repairs, but it includes scheduling, coordinating and expediting alteration, renovation and repair work, and vendor management.

Littleford's experience as a Repairer involves coordination of the maintenance of State vehicles and recording the information relating to this maintenance, such as mileage and maintenance history. This appears to be out-of-title work and does not match the announced experience requirement. On appeal,

Littleford provides information regarding a position not listed on his application, Senior Repairer, but in which he was appointed a month prior to the closing date. In this regard, the application is not a formality used to schedule examinations, as this agency makes official determinations for eligibility for all prospective candidates for positions in State or local Civil Service jurisdictions, since only those applicants who meet the minimum eligibility requirements are then evaluated through the testing process in order to determine relative merit and fitness. See In the Matter of Daniel Roach (Merit System Board, decided October 20, 2004). Pursuant to N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.1(f), any supplemental information received after the closing date cannot be considered.

The description of duties for Littleford's Senior Repairer position does not indicate that it has the announced experience as the primary focus, and in addition, the primary focus is maintaining minor maintenance on vehicles, maintaining the vehicle maintenance database, scheduling maintenance for vehicles, assisting in the dispatch of vehicles, and inspecting vehicles for damage, among other duties. Only one duty does not directly pertain to vehicles. The definition of the job specification for Senior Repairer includes performing the basic maintenance, repair or mechanical adjustment involved in varied types of buildings, building facilities, building utilities or furniture, and taking the lead over lower level repairers and helpers. Given the variance between Littleford's duties and the definition for Senior Repairer, Agency Services should perform a classification review of Littleford's current position.

As to Littleford's remaining positions, as Electrician, Carpenter, Electrician and Telecommunications Specialist, these positions do not have the general contract work in the announced experience requirement. That is, each focuses on one particular aspect of property management, but does not encompass the scope of the experience, including scheduling, coordinating and expediting alteration, renovation and repair work, and vendor management. Littleford lacks two years of applicable experience.

Norton received one year, eight months of credit for his provisional Building Services Coordinator 1 position. As a Senior Repairer and Repairer, the appellant was performing property maintenance, but was not scheduling, coordinating and expediting alteration, renovation and repair work, and vendor management. His experience as a Driver/Fire Fighter is clearly inapplicable.

The appellants were denied admittance to the subject examination since they lacked the minimum requirements in experience. An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decisions of Agency Services, that the appellants do not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date, are amply supported by the record. The appellants provide no basis to disturb

those decisions. Thus, the appellants have failed to support their burden of proof in these matters.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied and the classification of Littleford's current position be referred to Agency Services for further review.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 17th DAY OF OCTOBER, 2018

Derrare' L. Webster Calib

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries Christopher S. Myers

and Director

Correspondence Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P. O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Patrick Littleford Michael Norton Jr. Linda Dobron Kelly Glenn Records Center